Authenticity & Ethical Issues

Howard Besser
NYU Moving Image Archiving & Preservation Program
http://besser.nyu.edu/howard
http://www.nyu.edu/tisch/preservation/

Issues

• Issues of evidence and authenticity
• Issues of representation

What is the Conservator trying to do?

The Translation Problem

★ Content translated into new delivery devices changes meaning
  – A photo vs. a painting
  – Behaviors
  – If Info is produced originally in digital form in one encoded format, will it be the same when translated into another format?

The Translation Problem

Thinking of the Future (1/2)

• Screens will be different resolutions and different aspect ratios
• CRTs won’t exist
• A decade or 2 from now, today’s user interfaces will look like arrow-key navigation looks like today

Screen Formats
Issues with new works-

- What is the work?
- Is there an “original” to preserve?
- Complexity of rich media
- Difficulty of making the work last

LeWitt: Wall Drawing 340

Installing LeWitt

LeWitt Install Directions

LeWitt: What do we save?

- The installation?
- Documentation of the installation?
- The directions for the installation?
- What is the goal of our documentation and preservation?

Born-digital works

- Where is the “original”? 
Born-digital works are both easier and harder to preserve than analog works

+ With a born-digital work, we don’t have to worry so much about the “original artifact” (there really isn’t one)
- We know that digital works face a whole range of obsolescence problems, so they must be reformatted at least once per decade
Complexity of Rich Media

- Works often have artistic nature (including video games)
- Enormous number of elements can, at times, be very important to preserve (pacing, original artifact, elements used to construct the artifact)
- Too complex to save every one of these aspects for every type of material
- Importance of saving documentation

Management & Preservation: What are we trying to do?

- Show the work the way people saw and interacted with it when it was first created (may be impossible; in the past, the artifact and how one interacted with it didn’t change much, as preservation and documentation were relatively straightforward)
- Show documentation of the work and people interacting with it when it was first created
- Reinstall/Recreate/Reinact the work

Technical & Conceptual Approaches to Solutions-

- Save the Hardware & Software
- Emulate
- Migrate
- FRBR
- Artist Intentions

Multiple Approaches

- Capture the documentation
- Freeze a final version (eg. PDF of CAD)
- Capture the full functionality

Trade-offs
  - risk vs. safety
  - cheap vs. expensive
  - full functionality vs. reduced functionality

InterPARES-Digital Issues

- Authenticity
- Reliability
- Accuracy

Questions

- Why do we need museums? What should they look like? Why do we collect things? What kinds of museums and collections might we have in the future? What role might electronic media play in the rethinking of the museum? Would changes in museum practice necessitate changes in the disciplines of art history and anthropology?
Questions

- How are moving images and sound part of the larger visual culture and ways of looking and seeing? How does our understanding of visual culture impact our role in moving image archiving and preservation?
- How do reformatting and multiple formats of the same work change how we look at a work? (e.g., are videos the same as films? Are digital photographs the same as analog photos?)
- Is there a social context to viewing an object? (Is viewing a video at home the same as viewing a film in a theater? Is viewing a mural on a screen the same as viewing it in-situ?)

Questions

- Who attributes value to a work, and under what circumstances? How does one deal with the different values that different communities may have towards any particular set of works?
- Are there ethical considerations in format conversions (e.g., film colorization, pan-and-scan?)

Questions

- Does this evidential value change when materials are reformatted? What are the advantages and disadvantages of keeping different versions of materials?
- How do digital objects challenge traditional archival notions of evidence? Can ways be found to authenticate digital works, and track provenance and versioning?

Film Restoration Issues

- Lost Horizon example

Viewing Context

- Images like in Dayton-Hudson
Nitrate onto Safety Film?

Is this ok?

Colorizing if Director wanted it?

Metropolis

Silent Film (with piano?)

Silent Film (with orchestra?)
How do we save widescreen?

Anamorphic (wikipedia)

Commercial Reformatting Issues: PR at 1967 re-issue of GWTW

- “Spherical Blow-Up”
- “In the Splendor of 70mm. Wide screen and full stereophonic sound!”
- “For the thousands who remember its unparalleled drama, action and romance! For the new thousands to whom the wonders will be revealed for the first time! Breathtaking spectacle, inspired acting by the greatest cast ever assembled! The screen's most exciting love story! The most-talked about picture ever made!”

But most people didn’t know that 70mm widescreen is different shape than 35mm normal

Pan and Scan example

Change in Aspect Ratio forces cutting

Pan and Scan example
This meant eliminating part of the frame.

Eliminating even in famous scenes.

But the re-release wasn't governed by artistic concerns:
- Intellectual Property is owned by MGM, not by Fleming or Selznick
- MGM is motivated maximizing profit, not in maintaining artistic integrity
- Bigger is always better
- Not radically different than another blow to artistic integrity/originality in Atlanta 20 years later...

Star Wars “restoration”
- "The new technologies give Lucas the freedom to make the movie the way he wanted it," he added.
- The new scenes, he said, did change the movie.
- In one of the new scenes in Star Wars: Special Edition, Greedo, the bounty hunter, fires first before Solo kills him.
- "Han Solo’s character is definitely changed by the new scenes. In the original, Solo is seen as a dark character, when he shoots the bounty hunter without provocation, he doesn't seem like such a nice guy," Trimble said.

Michael Miller, “New scenes, restoration draw more people to theaters to explore the Force of Star Wars”, Digital Collegian (Penn State U), Feb 21, 1997

Star Wars “restoration”
- 1980, Emperor voice by Clive Revill
- 2004, Emperor voice by Ian McDiarmid

Star Wars “restoration”
The Empire Strikes Back
- 1980, Emperor voice by Clive Revill
- 2004, Emperor voice by Ian McDiarmid

Star Wars “restoration”
Return of Jedi
- In Darth Vader’s final scene, when he is not wearing his helmet, the eyebrows of actor Sebastian Shaw have been digitally removed, indicating what happens to Anakin’s eyebrows when he gets burned on Mustafar (shortly after a duel with Obi-Wan) in Revenge of the Sith. His eyes have also been changed to blue and minor cosmetic alterations have been made to his face to better resemble the Anakin portrayed by Hayden Christensen in the prequel trilogy.
- In the final scene where the spirits of Anakin Skywalker, Obi-Wan Kenobi, and Yoda appear to Luke, Anakin is now played by Hayden Christensen rather than Sebastian Shaw.

http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List_of_changes_in_Star_Wars_re-releases
Sometimes even the Director wants to go back and change their original film

Star Wars 1977 vs 2004

Someone needs to maintain the integrity of artistic works
- This means preserving original versions
  - even when commercial interests want to replace the older version with something new and fancy
  - even when the “artist” wants to use more recent technological developments to “improve” their work

Churchill Speeches
- Norman Shelley

1917 The stars and stripes forever march / J. P. Sousa ; [performed by] Imperial Marimba Band (Edison)

- [http://memory.loc.gov/mbrs/edrs/504661.wav](http://memory.loc.gov/mbrs/edrs/504661.wav)